



## ERRATA SHEET

**TO:** Chair Boyle and Members of the Architectural Review Board  
**FROM:** Alex Othon, Assistant Planner  
**MEETING DATE:** August 11, 2020  
**SUBJECT:** Architectural Review Board Meeting Agenda- Errata Sheet

**Attached is additional information for your consideration at the August 11, 2020 Architectural Review Board Meeting:**

| Agenda Item                   | Information Provided/Corrected  |
|-------------------------------|---|
| <b>6B – 1031 Shell Avenue</b> | <p>1. Project Data Sheet (<b>Attachment 1</b>)</p> <p>2. Pg. 2 of the Agenda Report states that the project will result in a one story home, this is incorrect and is changed to accurately reflect the project.</p> <p>“Architecture and Design Considerations<br/>The project will result in a one-story, single-family residence of 2,545 sq. ft. Exterior finishes on the proposed residence include standing seam metal roofing, vinyl clad windows, and a mix of wood and stucco sidings. The proposed architectural style, layout, and proposed materials assist the project in complying with a variety of the recommendations in the Residential Design Guidelines, including the following...”</p> <p>Has been changed to:</p> <p>“Architecture and Design Considerations<br/>The project will result in a <b>two</b>-story, single-family residence of 2,545 sq. ft. Exterior finishes on the proposed residence include standing seam metal roofing, vinyl clad windows, and a mix of wood and stucco sidings. The proposed architectural style, layout, and proposed materials assist the project in complying with a variety of the recommendations in the Residential Design Guidelines, including the following...”</p> |
| <b>6D – 1256 Surf Avenue</b>  | 1. Phase 1 Report ( <b>Attachment 2</b> )   |

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:

*Alex Othon*

Alex Othon, Assistant Planner

**PROJECT DATA SHEET**

**Project Address:** 1031 Shell

**Submittal Date:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Applicant(s):** Bill Metford

**Permit Type(s) & No(s):** \_\_\_\_\_

|  | <b>REQUIRED/<br/>Permitted</b> | <b>Existing<br/>Condition</b> | <b>Proposed<br/>Condition</b> | <b>Notes</b>    |
|--|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|
| <b>Zone District</b>   |                                | R-1                           | R-1                           |                 |
| <b>Building Site Area</b>  |                                | 5,018                         | N/A                           |                 |
| <b>Density (multi-family projects only)</b>  | -                              | -                             | -                             |                 |
| <b>Building Coverage</b>   | 2,007sf                        | 1502sf                        | 2,007sf                       |                 |
| <b>Site Coverage</b>   | 3,010sf                        | 1502sf                        | 2,950sf                       |                 |
| <b>Gross Floor Area</b>  | 2,545sf                        | 1502sf                        | 2,545sf                       |                 |
| <b>Square Footage not counted towards<br/>Gross Floor Area</b>                     |                                | ∅                             | 1,000sf                       | Basement<br>ADU |
| <b>Impervious Surface Area Created<br/>and/or Replaced</b>                         |                                |                               | 2950sf                        |                 |
| <b>Exterior Lateral Wall Length to be<br/>demolished in feet &amp; % of total*</b> | _____                          | _____                         | ____ft/____%                  |                 |
| <b>Exterior Lateral Wall Length to be built</b>                                    | _____                          | _____                         |                               |                 |
| <b>Building Height</b>   | 25'                            |                               | 25'                           |                 |
| <b>Number of stories</b>   |                                | 1                             | 2                             |                 |
| <b>Front Setback</b>   | 15'                            | 20'                           | 15'                           |                 |
| <u>East</u> Side Setback<br>(specify side)   | 8'4"                           | 11'                           | 8'5"                          |                 |
| <u>West</u> Side Setback<br>(specify side)   | 8'4"                           | 8'4"                          | 9'                            |                 |
| <b>Rear Setback</b>  | 10'                            | 15'                           | 10'                           |                 |
| <b>Garage Door Setback</b>   | 20'                            | 20'                           | 20'                           |                 |
| <b>Covered Parking Spaces</b>  | 1                              | 1                             | 1                             |                 |
| <b>Uncovered Parking Spaces</b>  | 1                              | 1                             | 1                             |                 |
| <b>Parking Space Size<br/>(Interior measurement)</b>                               | 9' x 20'                       | 9'x20'                        | 9'x20'                        |                 |
| <b>Number of Driveways</b>   | 1                              | 1                             | 1                             |                 |
| <b>Driveway Width(s)</b>   |                                | 13'                           | 17'5"                         |                 |
| <b>Back-up Distance</b>  |                                | 20'                           | 20'                           |                 |
| <b>Eave Projection (Into Setback)</b>  | 3' maximum                     |                               | 2'                            |                 |
| <b>Distances Between Eaves &amp; Property<br/>Lines</b>                            | 3' minimum                     |                               |                               |                 |
| <b>Open Porch/Deck Projections</b>   |                                |                               |                               |                 |
| <b>Architectural Feature Projections</b>   |                                |                               |                               |                 |
| <b>Number &amp; Category of Accessory<br/>Buildings</b>                            |                                | ∅                             | ∅                             |                 |
| <b>Accessory Building Setbacks</b>   |                                | N/A                           | N/A                           |                 |
| <b>Distance between Buildings</b>  |                                | N/A                           | N/A                           |                 |
| <b>Accessory Building Heights</b>  |                                | N/A                           | N/A                           |                 |
| <b>Fence Heights</b>   |                                |                               |                               |                 |

\*If project proposes demolition to an HRI structure, also indicate % of proposed demolition of the surface of all exterior walls facing a public street or streets, if applicable.

P A S T  
CONSULTANTS LLC

Seth A. Bergstein  
415.515.6224  
seth@pastconsultants.com

---

August 10, 2020

Aaron Tollefson, Principal  
AST Design Group  
957 Angelus Way  
Del Rey Oaks, CA 93940

Re: Phase One Historic Assessment for 1256 Surf Avenue, Pacific Grove, CA  
APN. 006-011-017-000

Dear Mr. Tollefson:

This letter states the findings of historic significance, based on our research and conditions assessment of the property located at 1256 Surf Avenue, in Pacific Grove, California. PAST Consultants, LLC (PAST) attended a site and performed research in local repositories during August 2020 to determine the potential historic significance of the subject property.

1256 Surf Ave. contains a modified one-and one half-story house (1968) constructed in the Modern style. The original house had a gable roof with exposed beams and wide overhangs, clerestory windows in the gable end; original walls containing Redwood posts with brick and random stone infill; a single chimney; and aluminum-framed windows (**Figures 1 – 2**).



**Figures 1 and 2.** Left image shows the front elevation, with gable end containing the clerestory windows. Right image details the right side entrance, post-and-brick walls with random stone and second-story addition over the garage.

---

P.O. Box 721  
Pacific Grove, CA 93950  
www.pastconsultants.com

Modifications include a second-story addition over the garage installed in 1985 (**Figures 2 and 3**). The addition has stucco wall cladding above the garage, on the right side-elevation's walls, the rear of the building and part of the left side-elevation's wall. It appears that the stucco cladding was applied to the original post-and-brick wall cladding and subsequently painted (**Figures 3 and 4**).



**Figures 3 and 4.** Left image shows the rear elevation, with the newer stucco cladding applied over the original post-and-brick wall cladding (arrow). Right image shows the front and left side elevations, with newer stucco cladding applied to the original walls (arrows).

### Construction Chronology

Based on the permit record retrieved from the City of Pacific Grove's Planning Department files, the following lists the construction chronology with permit numbers when available:

- Permit #193, 7/30/1968. Construct single-story dwelling. William Locke listed as builder/owner.
- No Permit #, 5/8/1985. Construct second-story addition over garage. Install stucco wall cladding over original building walls. Architect: T.R. Larsen and Associates.

### Property History

Because of its location, the subject property does not appear on existing Sanborn maps. Located on Block 357, Lot 7 of the Fairway Homes tract, the subject house was likely constructed as a "spec" house by local contractor (also listed as building owner on the original permit) William J. Locke. Local city directories list William J. Locke (1920 - 1973) as a building contractor from the 1950s until 1969 (*Polk's Monterey Pacific Grove City Directories: 1953 - 1969*). Born in Plymouth, Massachusetts, William J. Locke served as a private in the U.S. Army during World War II. He was killed in a head-on vehicle collision on Highway 68 in 1973.<sup>1</sup> Research did not reveal any contributions by William J. Locke to national, California or Pacific Grove history.

<sup>1</sup> "Route 68 Crash Kills Driver," *Salinas Californian*, 11/13/1973.

## **National Register, California Register and City of Pacific Grove Historic Resources Inventory (HRI) Significance**

### **Conclusion**

The subject property is not historic, because the changes made to the building have removed its historic integrity of design, workmanship, materials and feeling from the property. The circa-1985 second-story addition modified the spatial relationships, exterior wall cladding and ornamentation from the original house. In its present condition, these changes make the subject house no longer a distinctive representative of the Modern style in Pacific Grove.

### **National Register Significance**

The subject property is not significant according to National Register criteria. The house is not associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of National or California history (Criterion A). The subject house is not associated with suburbanization in California or Pacific Grove, as the surrounding neighborhood does not contain a concentration of homes designed under suburban principles.<sup>2</sup> The house's historical occupant did not contribute significantly to national, California, or Pacific Grove history (Criterion B). The altered Modern design does not represent a particularly distinctive example of the Modern building style in California or Pacific Grove (Criterion C), due to the alterations.

### **California Register Significance**

As the National and California registers use the same criteria, the subject residence is not significant under California-register criteria for the same reasons described above.

### **City of Pacific Grove Historic Resources Inventory (HRI)**

The following lists the eligibility criteria for local listing in the City of Pacific Grove's Historic Resources Inventory (HRI) as stated in the City of Pacific Grove's Historic Preservation Ordinance (Municipal Code §23.76.025), with a response in italics:

**a.** Whether the structure has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the city of Pacific Grove, the state of California, or the United States;

*The subject house does not possess sufficient aesthetic or cultural characteristics that communicate a significant part of the culture or architectural development of Pacific Grove, California or the United States.*

**b.** Whether it is the site of a significant historic event;

*The subject property is not the site of a significant historic event. The subject property was developed after World War II, in a location where infill development in various postwar styles was occurring, rather than in planned suburban developments.*

**c.** Whether it is strongly identified with a person who, or an organization that significantly contributed to the culture, history or development of the city of Pacific Grove;

---

<sup>2</sup> Page and Turnbull, Inc., *Pacific Grove Historic Context Statement*, 2011, 263.

*Research on the property's owner, William J. Locke, has revealed that he did not contribute to the culture, history or development of Pacific Grove.*

**d.** Whether it is a particularly good example of a period or style;

*The subject house is not a particularly good example of a postwar Modern-style building, particularly due to the alterations.*

**e.** Whether it is one of the few remaining examples in the city of Pacific Grove possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type or specimen;

*The subject house is a common and altered Modern design and is not one of the few remaining examples of this style in Pacific Grove.*

**f.** Whether it is a notable work of an architect or master builder whose individual work has significantly influenced the development of the city of Pacific Grove;

*The building was not designed by a notable architect, nor was it constructed by a significant builder, as William J. Locke is not considered a significant builder, according to the Pacific Grove Historic Context Statement.*

**g.** Whether it embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials or craftsmanship that represent a significant architectural innovation;

*The subject house's Modern design and materials palette have been altered and no longer embody distinctive elements of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship, particularly due to the alterations.*

**h.** Whether it has a unique location or singular physical characteristics representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or Pacific Grove;

*The subject property is not in a unique location, or an established visual feature of the neighborhood in Pacific Grove.*

**i.** Whether it retains the integrity of the original design;

*The subject property does not possess integrity of original design, due to the alterations.*

**j.** Whether it contributes to the architectural aesthetics and continuity of the street; and

*The subject house does not contribute to the architectural aesthetics of the neighborhood in a distinctive manner. Other houses of better design style and condition exist in the surrounding area.*

**k.** Whether it is located within a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic properties, which visually contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically.

*The subject property is not located in an area containing a concentration of historic properties.*

According to the *City of Pacific Grove Historic Context Statement*, the house is categorized under the theme, "Suburban Expansion (1946 – 1966)" as the residence was constructed in 1968 during the end of the suburbanization period for the City and surrounding area. The tables summarizing significance under Criterion C (architectural significance) state:

Architectural significance is best reserved for buildings that demonstrate particularly strong artistic merit, or that clearly demonstrate the influence of a particular architect or builder. Consideration should also be given to examples of styles that are relatively rare as compared to other residential buildings of the period. Resources qualified under these criteria must be excellent examples of types and/or styles, and retain most of their original features (page 264).

The subject property does not demonstrate a particular architect or builder's influence. It is a common Modern design and is not an outstanding or excellent example of its style. In addition, the house has been altered with a second-story addition and changes to its exterior wall cladding.

The following lists the Minimum Eligibility Requirements and Other Integrity Considerations taken from the *City of Pacific Grove Historic Context Statement* (page 265) with a response in italics.

Minimum Eligibility Requirements:

- Exceptional example of residential architecture from this period.  
*The subject house is not an exceptional example of a Modern-style building.*
- Retains original form and roofline.  
*The house does not retain its original form and roofline.*
- Retains the original pattern of windows and doors.  
*The house does retain most of the original pattern of windows and doors.*
- Retains its original entry, window and/or roofline ornamentation.  
*The original entry and roofline have been altered.*
- Retains original cladding.  
*The house retains some original cladding, but the cladding has been covered with stucco as part of the 1985 alterations. All remaining original cladding has been painted.*
- Replacement windows must conform to the size of the original openings.  
*The window replacements were made in original and new openings.*
- Additions are generally not acceptable.  
*The house has undergone a second-story addition, and alterations to windows and original wall cladding.*

Other Integrity Considerations:

The *Historic Context Statement* states:

Residences qualified as historic resources for their association with historic events or persons need not be “exceptional” examples of residential architecture. However, they should retain the majority of features present when the event occurred, or when the building was associated with a significant individual (page 265).

Since the subject residence is not associated with a significant event or a significant person, this integrity consideration should relate to the intact design of the building. The subject house is a common Modern design and has been altered with various additions. Because of the additions, the house is not a particularly outstanding example of Modern design in Pacific Grove and would not be eligible for the Historic Resources Inventory (HRI).

In conclusion, 1256 Surf Ave. does not qualify as an individual historic resource under national- or State of California-register criteria. The property does not qualify for individual listing on the City of Pacific Grove's HRI.

Please contact me if you have any questions about this evaluation.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Seth Bergstein". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial 'S'.

Seth A. Bergstein  
Principal

Cc: City of Pacific Grove Community Development Department