



## MINUTES

# CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD REGULAR MEETING AGENDA

4:00 p.m., February 27, 2018

Council Chambers – City Hall – 300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove, CA

**1. Called to Order – 4:00 pm**

**2. Roll Call**

Architectural Review Board Members: Sarah Boyle, Jeff Edmonds, Michael Gunby, Tom Lane, Terrence Coen, Rick Shekell,

Absent: Jen Veitengruber

**3. Election of Officers:** Chair, Vice-Chair and Secretary

**On a motion by Member Gunby, seconded by Member Lane, the Board voted 6-0-1 (Veitengruber absent) to elect Member Boyle as Chair. Motion passed.**

**On a motion by Member Gundy, seconded by Member Lane, the Board voted 6-0-1 (Veitengruber absent) to elect Member Edmonds as Vice-Chair. Motion passed.**

**On a motion by Member Gunby, seconded by Member Edmonds, the Board voted 6-0-1 (Veitengruber absent) to elect Member Lane as Secretary. Motion passed.**

**4. Approval of Agenda**

Upon a written request from a member of the public, Chair Boyle moved Item 7.a (207 16<sup>th</sup> Street) from the Consent Agenda to the Regular Agenda as Item 8.e.

**On a motion by Member Gunby, seconded by Member Lane, the Board voted 6-0-1 (Veitengruber absent) to approve the Agenda as amended. Motion passed.**

**5. Approval of Minutes**

**a. Approval of January 23, 2018 Minutes**

**Recommended Action:** Approve as presented

Member Gunby suggested one correction to item 7a.

**On a motion by Member Gunby, seconded by Member Edmonds, the Board voted 6-0-1 (Veitengruber absent) to approve the minutes with the suggested correction. Motion passed.**

**6. Public Comments**

**a. Written Communications**

**None.**

b. Oral Communications

Chair Boyle announced the public comments will be limited to two minutes per person and 10 minutes per architect presenting new projects.

Don Murphy, resident, asked the Chair to not rush through the Agenda and provide enough time for public comment.

Lisa Ciani, resident, expressed concerns about reduced public comment period and asked whether advance notification could be provided regarding reduced public comment period.

Wendy Lao, Associate Planner, responded to Ms. Ciani's public comment.

Anthony Ciani, resident, asked the Board members and staff regarding whether new ARB members are being kept abreast of the CEQA documents for the large projects.

Wendy Lao, Associate Planner, responded to Mr. Ciani's public comment.

7. Consent Agenda

- a. *This item was moved to item 8e under the Regular Agenda*

**Address:** 207 16<sup>th</sup> Street (006-281-009)

**Permit Application:** Architectural Permit 18-096

**Project Description:** To allow the replacement of all windows, to paint the exterior and to install new awnings.

**Applicant/Owner:** Samuel Pitnick, Architect, on behalf of Greg Zimmerman, owner.

**Zone District/ Land Use:** C-D/ Commercial

**CEQA Status:** Categorical Exemption, Section 15301 Class 1, Existing Facilities

**Staff Reference:** Laurel O'Halloran, Associate Planner

**Recommended Action:** Approve, subject to recommended findings and conditions.

Upon a written request from a member of the public, Chair Boyle moved Item 7.a 207 16<sup>th</sup> Street from the Consent Agenda to the Regular Agenda as Item 8.e.

8. Regular Agenda

- a. **Address:** 1355 Lighthouse Ave, Pacific Grove (APN 007-031-017)

**Permit Application:** Architectural Permit (AP) and Tree Permit with Development (TPD) 16-582

**Project Description:** Adoption of Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration, and approval of AP TPD 16-582 to allow a new 5,367 gross sq. ft. two-story single-family residence with an attached 3-car garage on a vacant property. The site is located in the Coastal Zone, the Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area, and the Archaeological Zone. The project proposes to remove 5 Pine trees, and will be replaced with 32 replants. The project is requesting a water fixture unit count of 16.4 for a single-family residence through the Monterey Peninsula Water Management District, and would be placed on the City's water waitlist.

**Applicant/Owner:** Joseph Rock, architect, on behalf of Kevin and Linda Smith,

owners

**Zone District/ Land Use:** R-1-B-4/Low Density to 5.4 DU/ac

**CEQA Status:** Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration

**Staff Reference:** Wendy Lao, Associate Planner

**Recommended Action:** Adopt an Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration, and approve AP TPD 16-582, subject to recommended findings and conditions.

*Continued from January 23, 2018*

Wendy Lao, Associate Planner, presented a staff report.

The Chair opened the floor to public comments.

The following members of the public spoke:

Kevin Smith, property owner, spoke in support of the project.

Tom Moss, biologist, on behalf of property owner, spoke about the habitat restoration plan.

Joan Smith, resident, spoke in support of the project.

Greg Edenholm, resident, inquired about the project.

Lisa Ciani, resident, expressed concerns about the project.

Karen Locke, resident, expressed concerns about the project.

Tom Burgg, resident, spoke in support of the project.

Anthony Ciani, resident, expressed concerns about the project.

Gwen Baldi, resident, spoke in support of the project.

Cit Smith, resident, spoke in support of the project.

David Kidd, resident, expressed concerns about the project.

Louise Ramirez, Chair of Ohlone Costanoan Esselen Nation (OCEN) Native American Tribe, expressed concerns of the project.

Vince Alfait, resident, expressed concerns about the project.

Cliff Roseman, resident, spoke in support of the project.

Holly Keifer, resident, expressed concerns about the project.

Francos Melese, resident, spoke in support of the project.

Pamela Silkwood, attorney on behalf of the property owners, spoke in support of the project.

The Board discussed the project.

**On a motion by Member Gunby, seconded by Member Lane, the Board voted 6-0-1 (Member Veitengruber absent) to adopt the Initial Study and Mitigated Negative Declaration and approve the project subject to recommended findings and conditions, with the following additional condition:**

**Conservation Easement: Approximately 90 percent of the property shall remain undeveloped and be subject to a conservation easement administered by a non-governmental organization. If a non-governmental organization cannot be found in a timely manner to accept the conservation easement, a deed restriction shall be implemented to restrict development on 90 percent of the property.**

**Motion passed.**

**b. Address: 935 Balboa Avenue(006-033-002)**

**Permit Application:** Architectural Permit 17- 1000

**Project Description:** To demolition the existing 1,633 square foot single-story single family residence and build a new 2,606 square foot two-story single family residence

**Applicant/Owner:** James Smith, Architect on behalf of Ken Krings and Craig Giraupo, owners

**Zone District/ Land Use:** R-1/Medium Density 17.4 du/ac

**CEQA Status:** Categorical Exemption, Section 15301 Class 1, Existing Facilities

**Staff Reference:** Laurel O'Halloran, Associate Planner

**Recommended Action:** Approve, subject to recommended findings and conditions.

Laurel O'Halloran, Project Planner presented a Staff report.

The Chair opened the floor to public comments.

James Smith, Project Architect presented a project report.

The owner, Craig Giraupo, spoke in favor of the project.

Jack Cardoazza, neighbor, spoke against the project.

Floyd View, neighbor, spoke against the project.

Louise Ramirez, Tribal representative, expressed concern over the sensitive area.

Gail and Richard Salse, neighbors, spoke in favor of the project.

Carol Gruncrow, neighbor, spoke in favor of the project.

Ken Krings, Owner expressed that they took into consideration views and impacts to neighbors.

Lisa Ciani, concerned citizen, request the project be continued to allow for additional time for native consideration.

Gwen Blaney, neighbor, spoke in favor of the project.

Guy Fances, neighbor, spoke in favor of the project.

Karen Cardoazza, neighbor, spoke in opposition to the project.

Michael Village, neighbor, spoke in favor of the project.

Linda Moller, Neighbor, spoke in favor of the project.

Rosie Edwards, neighbor, spoke in opposition to the project.

The Chair closed the floor to public comments.

The ARB members discussed the project

**On a motion by Member Gunby, seconded by Member Lane the Board voted 6-0-1 (Veitengruber absent) to approve the project with the following additional condition:**

**The applicant will work with the Tribal Representative to allow for tribal monitoring during ground disturbance.**

**c. Address: 518 Beaumont Avenue (006-685-001)**

**Permit Application:** Architectural Permit 18-113

**Project Description:** To allow a second story addition of 854 square feet for a master bedroom and bathroom to an existing 2,916 square foot single story single family residence including the garage for a total of a 3,770 square foot two-story single family residence

**Applicant/Owner:** Dale Bender, Contractor on behalf of Ellen Haley, owner

**Zone District/ Land Use:** R-1/Medium Density 17.4 du/ac

**CEQA Status:** Categorical Exemption, Section 15301 Class 1, Existing Facilities

**Staff Reference:** Laurel O'Halloran, Associate Planner

**Recommended Action:** Approve, subject to recommended findings and conditions.

Laurel O'Halloran, Project Planner presented a Staff report.

The Chair opened the floor to public comments.

Ellen Haley, owner, spoke in favor of approving the project.

Katherine Whitaker, neighbor, spoke in opposition to the project.

The Chair closed the floor to public comments.

**On a motion by Member Gunby seconded by Member Edmonds the Board voted 6-0-1 (Veitengruber absent) to continue this item to the March 27, 2018 Architectural Review Board meeting. Motion passed.**

**d. Address: 1635 Sunset Drive (APN 007-041-020)**

**Permit Application:** Architectural Permit (AP) & Tree Permit with Development (TPD) 17-132

**Project Description:** Adoption of Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration, and approval of AP TPD 17-132 to create a new 2,942 sq. ft. single-family residence with an attached garage on a vacant property. The site is located in the Coastal Zone, the Environmentally Sensitive Habitat Area, and the Archaeological Zone. The project proposes to remove a 5 inch Monterey Pine tree, remove a 6 inch Sidney Golden Wattle Acacia tree, and trim two Monterey Cypress trees. The project is requesting a water fixture unit count of 18.4 through the Monterey Peninsula Water Management District, and will be placed on the City's water waitlist.

**Applicant/Owner:** Joel Panzer, applicant, on behalf of Jeremy & Tiffany Cieslak, owners

**Zone District/ Land Use:** R-1-B-4/Low Density to 5.4 DU/ac

**CEQA Status:** Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration

**Staff Reference:** Wendy Lao, Associate Planner

**Recommended Action:** Adopt an Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration, and approve AP TPD 17-132, subject to recommended findings and conditions.

Wendy Lao, Associate Planner, presented a staff report.

The Chair opened the floor to public comments.

The following members of the public spoke:

Joel Panzer of Maureen Wruck Planning Consultant, LLC, project applicant, spoke in support of the project.

Craig Steely, architect, presented the project.

Jeremy Cieslak, property owner, spoke in support of the project.

Louise Ramirez, Chair of Ohlone Costanoan Esselen Nation (OCEN) Native American Tribe, spoke in support of the project.

Lisa Ciani, resident, expressed concerns about the project.

**On a motion by Member Gunby, seconded by Member Lane the Board voted 6-0-1 (Member Veitengruber absent) to adopt the Initial Study and Mitigated Negative Declaration and approve Architectural Permit 17-132 subject to**

**recommended findings and conditions. Motion passed.**

e. *Previously on the Consent Agenda*

**Address:** 207 16<sup>th</sup> Street (006-281-009)

**Permit Application:** Architectural Permit 18-096

**Project Description:** To allow the replacement of all windows, to paint the exterior and to install new awnings.

**Applicant/Owner:** Samuel Pitnick, Architect, on behalf of Greg Zimmerman, owner.

**Zone District/ Land Use:** C-D/ Commercial

**CEQA Status:** Categorical Exemption, Section 15301 Class 1, Existing Facilities

**Staff Reference:** Laurel O'Halloran, Associate Planner

**Recommended Action:** Approve, subject to recommended findings and conditions.

Laurel O'Halloran, Project Planner presented a Staff report.

Samual Pitnick, Project Architect, presented the project report.

Lisa Ciani, Concerned citizen, spoke in opposition to the project.

Tony Ciani, Concerned citizen, spoke in opposition to the project.

Victoria Royal, spoke on behalf of owner Greg Zimmerman, explaining the recently purchased building is in deterioration and the owner's goal is to improve the entire building and get tenants in to help improve the commercial downtown.

**The Chair closed Public Comment.**

**On a motion by Member Lane, seconded by Member Edmonds, the Board voted 6-0-1 (Member Veitengruber absent) to approve the project with the following additional condition:**

**The applicant will coordinate with Staff to tone down the white paint.**

**9. Reports of ARB Members**

Member Gunby stated the he attended the City Employee of the Year 2018 event.

Chair Boyle welcomed Member Coen to the Board and appreciated his willingness to serve.

**10. Reports of Council Liaison, Rudy Fischer**

None.

**11. Staff Update**

Laurel O'Halloran, Associate Planner, informed the Board that staff will be bringing forward the Hotel Durell project to the Board for consideration at the March 27, 2018 meeting.

**12. Adjourned 7:08 p.m.**

APPROVED BY ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

\_\_\_\_\_  
Tom Lane, Secretary

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

DRAFT